DOCUMENT RESUME

ED 341 117 EA 023 498

AUTHOR Klass, Patricia Harrington; Michael, Noreen
TITLE The Job Satisfaction-Life Satisfaction Relationship for Educators: A Cross-Cultural Study.
PUB DATE Oct 91
NOTE 24p.; Paper presented at the Annual Meeting of the Midwestern Educational Research Association (Chicago, IL, October 1991).
PUB TYPE Reports - Research/Technical (143) -- Speeches/Conference Papers (150)

EDRS PRICE MF01/PC01 Plus Postage.
DESCRIPTORS *Administrator Attitudes; *Cross Cultural Studies; *Graduate Students; Higher Education; *Job Satisfaction; *Life Satisfaction

ABSTRACT

This study replicates a cross-cultural study by Steiner and Truxillo (1987) that tested completing hypotheses concerning the relationship between job and life satisfaction. It tested the generalization of the original study in two ways: it examined educators instead of managers and it compared those from Western and Eastern cultures rather than two Western cultures. The 59 subjects represented two distinct groups, 34 American (17 females, 17 males) and 25 Thai graduate students (13 females, 12 males). The short-form of the Minnesota Satisfaction Questionnaire (Weiss and others, 1967) was selected to measure intrinsic and extrinsic job satisfaction; a scale developed by Hofstede (1980) measured work and nonwork values, and a scale developed by Burke, Weir, and DuWors (1979) measured life satisfaction. Factor analysis results failed to support the prior study's selection of items for intrinsic and extrinsic job satisfaction. Results of the multiple regression analysis support the spillover theory for the relationship between both intrinsic and extrinsic job satisfaction and life satisfaction (p .05) contrary to Steiner and Truxillo's findings. Implications are discussed. (Author/RR)

****
* Reproductions supplied by EDRS are the best that can be made *
* from the original document. *
****

ED341117

The Job Satisfaction-Life Satisfaction Relationship for Educators: A Cross-Cultural Study

Patricia Harrington Klass & Noreen Michael
Department of Educational Administration and Foundations
Illinois State University

Paper Presented at
The Midwestern Education Research Association Conference
Chicago, Illinois
October 18, 1991

Running Head: JOB SATISFACTION-LIFE SATISFACTION

EA 023 498

BEST COPY AVAILABLE

U.S. DEPARTMENT OF EDUCATION
Office of Educational Research and Improvement
EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES INFORMATION CENTER (ERIC)
☑ This document has been reproduced as received from the person or organization originating it.
☐ Minor changes have been made to improve reproduction quality.
• Points of view or opinions stated in this document do not necessarily represent official OERI position or policy.

"PERMISSION TO REPRODUCE THIS MATERIAL HAS BEEN GRANTED BY
P. H. Klass
TO THE EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES INFORMATION CENTER (ERIC)."

Abstract

The purpose of this study was to replicate a cross-cultural study by Steiner and Truxillo (1987) that tested competing hypotheses concerning the relationship between job and life satisfaction. The 59 subjects represented two distinct groups: 34 American (17 females, 17 males) and 25 Thai graduate students (13 females, 12 males). The short-form of the Minnesota Satisfaction Questionnaire (MSQ) (Weiss, Dawis, England, & Lofquist, 1967) was selected to measure intrinsic and extrinsic job satisfaction, a scale developed by Hofstede (1980) measured work and nonwork values, and a scale developed by Burke, Weir, and DuWors (1979) measured life satisfaction. Factor analysis results failed to support the prior study's selection of items for intrinsic and extrinsic job satisfaction. Results of the multiple regression analysis support the spillover theory for the relationship between both intrinsic and extrinsic job satisfaction and life satisfaction, $p < .05$, contrary to Steiner and Truxillo's findings. Implications are discussed.

The Job Satisfaction-Life Satisfaction Relationship for Educators: A Cross-Cultural Study

Satisfaction with one's job, one's life, and the value of work are central variables in understanding the life of both administrators and faculty. There has been much debate regarding these variables and their relationship to job performance, turnover, and burnout for administrators and faculty. Further, comparing the results across cultures reveals some unique aspects of these variables that may limit generalizability.

As Steiner and Truxillo (1987) have noted, the relationship between job satisfaction and life satisfaction has been problematic for researchers. Some studies support the spillover model where the two variables are positively related, while others have found support for the compensatory model where the two are negatively related. A third group has found no relationship between the two variables (segmentalist approach). Steiner and Truxillo went beyond previous studies by considering intrinsic and extrinsic job satisfaction separately rather than using general job satisfaction. As they noted "extrinsic outcomes included those things that people can take with them when they leave the job....intrinsic outcomes, on the other hand, included things that can only be enjoyed while at work (p. 75). They predicted that "the disaggregation hypothesis is expected to hold for intrinsic job satisfaction, and the spillover model is hypothesized to hold for extrinsic job satisfaction" (p. 72). Using a sample of French and American managers and technical employees, they found support for both research hypotheses. However, they failed to examine the

results separately for French and Americans nor did they examine the instrument's internal consistency or factor structure for the two groups. This may have not been necessary because of the similarities in French and American cultures. However, would the distinction between intrinsic and extrinsic satisfaction hold for educators in an Asian culture such as Thailand?

As Hofstede (1980) has noted, the value of work depends, in part, on one's culture. He also argued that cross-cultural research in this area may also be hampered by ethnocentrism in the design or the instruments used. Thus, although Steiner and Truxillo (1987) aggregate results for French and American employees (from two Western cultures), it is not clear that this can be done when comparing the value of work for American and Thai educators (from Western and Eastern cultures).

The purpose of this study was to replicate a study by Steiner and Truxillo (1987) that tested competing hypotheses concerning the relationship between job and life satisfaction. The replication differed from the original in that administrators, faculty, and other educational personnel were studied instead of managerial and technical employees. Secondly, like the original, this study was cross-cultural but compared American and Thai educators rather than American and French employees. Thus, this study tested the generalizability of the original study in two ways: it examined educators instead of managers and it compared those from Western and Eastern cultures rather than two Western cultures. Validity issues related to using these instruments cross-culturally were also examined.

Method

Subjects

Two intact groups of graduate students enrolled in a research methodology and statistics class composed the sample. The 59 students represented two distinct groups: 34 American (17 females, 17 males) and 25 Thai graduate students (13 females, 12 males). Both groups were full- or part-time students enrolled in the Educational Administration and Foundations program at a midwestern university during the fall 1990 semester. The mean age for the students was 41.5 years, ranging from 28 to 54 years old. The majority of students were either practicing administrators or were working toward that goal. Half the students were full-time administrators (50%), while the remainder were full-time teachers (13.8%), half-time teachers and administrators (10.3%) or other (25.9%), which included full-time students, counselors, and part-time faculty who had other full-time employment outside of education.

Instrument

The short-form of the Minnesota Satisfaction Questionnaire (MSQ) (Weiss, Dawis, England, & Lofquist, 1967) was selected to measure intrinsic (IS) and extrinsic (ES) job satisfaction. The instrument was developed using the theory of work adjustment (Lofquist & Dawis, 1969). The manual reported a median Hoyt internal consistency reliability for the short-form MSQ of .86 for the IS scale, and .80 for the ES scale. For the Thai-American sample the coefficient alpha reliabilities were .84 for IS and .67 for ES. No test-retest reliabilities were reported for the short form; however, for the long form the

general satisfaction scale ranged from .89 after one week and .70 after one year. Evidence of construct, content, and concurrent validities (Weiss, et al., 1967) were presented. The instrument was also selected so the Thai students would not have any problems with the vocabulary.

Because some authors have criticized the items selected for the intrinsic and extrinsic scales, Steiner and Truxillo (1987) did not use the items as originally configured in their IS and ES scales. As seen in Table 1, they removed the three supervision items from the ES scale (5, 6, 19) and moved two items from the IS scale (4, 8) to the ES scale. In addition, they moved one item from the ES scale (12) to the IS scale. Thus, IS was measured by the mean of 11 items instead of 12; ES was measured by the mean of 4 items instead of 6. When comparing the coefficient alpha reliabilities from the Steiner and Truxillo study to this study, one sees that for IS the values were identical (α = .84), while for ES the Thai-American coefficient was lower (α = .60) than the replicated study (α = .66).

Insert Table 1 about here

Life satisfaction (LS) was measured using the mean of two items reported in Burke, Weir, and DuWors (1979). They asked "Taking all things together, how would you say things are these days? Would you say you're very happy (5), pretty happy (3) or not too happy (1)?" and "In general, how satisfying do you find the way you're spending your life these days? Would you call it completely satisfying (5), pretty satisfying (3), or not very satisfying

(1)?" (p. 59). For the Thai-American sample, coefficient alpha was .90, while Steiner and Truxillo (1987) reported .87. The third construct measured in this study was work-nonwork (WN) values. This study used the mean of two questions created by Hofstede (1980) asking "In choosing an ideal job, how important would it be to you to have sufficient time left for your personal or family life?" and "In choosing an ideal job, how important would it be to you to live in an area desirable to you and your family?". A score of 1 indicated the value was very important while a score of 5 indicated the value was very unimportant. The higher the value, the more emphasis is placed on work values in comparison to nonwork values. For this sample the alpha coefficient was .45, while in the Steiner and Truxillo study, it was .57.

Procedure

Students received the short form of the MSQ and other measures during the fall 1990 semester. Both the American and Thai students were administered the questionnaires during class time by the course instructor. The English form was used with both groups. All Thai students were admitted into a graduate program in Educational Administration at a midwestern university and met all admission and English-proficiency requirements of the University. Students took approximately 15 minutes to complete the instruments.

SPSS/PC+ was used for all data analyses. The factor analysis was done by specifying a two-factor solution, with a specification of a principal component extraction and a varimax rotation. Multiple regression analysis was used to estimate the prediction equation. The significance level was set at .05.

Results

Factor Analysis

An examination of Table 1 indicates the items that defined intrinsic and extrinsic job satisfaction for Steiner and Truxillo (1987), Weiss et al. (1967), and this study. In the replicated study, the authors based their choice of items for intrinsic and extrinsic satisfaction on theory and criticisms of the original MSQ scales by other researchers. In the original Weiss study, one item from each of the original 20 scales in the long form was selected for the short form. Although factor loadings for the original 20 scales were reported in the long form, no factor loadings were reported for the short-form items. The two factors extracted for this study were based on the actual responses of the 59 subjects.

This study's findings differed from both prior studies. More specifically, Table 2 reflects the results of the factor analysis for both Thai and American subjects combined as one group. Based on the information presented, it is clear that the results for the two groups combined differed from those based on theory as defined by Steiner and Truxillo (1987) or Weiss, et al. (1967). Specifically, if factor one is viewed as representing the IS construct, then the elements can best be described as unstable for this sample. The asterisked items are the only ones that were in common to those used by Steiner and Truxillo. While five of the items that loaded on factor one were not included in the original definition of intrinsic job satisfaction, seven of the original items used to define this construct did not load on factor one for this combined group.

Insert Table 2 about here

In considering the results as they relate to ES (factor 2), Table 2 can again be examined. Eight of the 20 items loaded on this factor. Again, with respect to Steiner and Truxillo's study, only three of these eight items (asterisked) fit the researchers' definition of the construct extrinsic job satisfaction.

Table 3 represents the results of the factor analysis for the Thai and American subjects considered separately. The factor analysis was conducted for exploratory purposes only because the number of cases was inadequate in relation to the number of variables in the scale. However, because the study was cross-cultural, tentative results may provide some insight into groups differences, if any. Results for factor one were most closely in line with Steiner and Truxillo's definition of IS for both groups. Of the 11 items the researchers' used in their definition, 9 loaded on factor one for the Thai subjects and 7 loaded for the American subjects. However, between two and five items that loaded on this factor were not included in the researchers' definition of intrinsic job satisfaction.

Insert Table 3 about here

With respect to ES, results differed from those of Steiner and Truxillo for both groups. Of the four items used by the researchers to define ES, only

one loaded on factor two for Thai subjects and none for American subjects. None of the other items that loaded on factor two were used by Steiner and Truxillo in their definition of extrinsic job satisfaction.

Despite these differences based on the factor analysis results, the internal consistency reliabilities of .84 (IS) and .67 (ES) for the Thai and American sample using Steiner and Truxillo's definition of these scales were deemed sufficient to proceed with the regression analysis with the modified MSQ scales.

Regression

To test the disaggregation, spillover, and segmentalist hypotheses regarding the relationship between job and life satisfaction, two separate regressions were run for IS and ES. In each model life satisfaction was sequentially regressed on job satisfaction, work-nonwork values, and the job satisfaction work-nonwork values interaction to test the significance in the increase in R^2. Table 4 displays the descriptive data and intercorrelation matrix among these variables.

Insert Table 4 about here

There was a significant main effect for the IS main effect alone, $F(1,54) = 8.09$, $p = .0063$ ($b = .59$), but not work-nonwork values when both were in the model, $R^2 = .13$, $F(2,53) = 3.99$, $p = .0242$. Further, the interaction was not significant when it was added to the model ($b = -.16$, $t = -.52$, $p = .6070$).

For ES the results were similar. There was a significant main effect for ES alone, $F(1,55) = 9.98$, $p = .0026$ ($b = .55$), but not work-nonwork values when both were in the model, $R^2 = .15$, $F(2,54) = 4.90$, $p = .0111$. Further, the interaction was not significant when it was added to the model ($b = .05$, $t = .223$, $p = .8242$).

For exploratory purposes based on the differences found between groups in the factor analysis results, regression data were analyzed separately for Thai and American educators. Results differed for the two groups. As seen in Table 5, for IS, all three variables were significant for the Thai cohort, $F(3,19) = 4.24$, $p = .0187$, $R^2 = .40$. IS ($b = 5.64$) and work-nonwork values ($b = 9.95$) were positively related to life satisfaction, while the interaction ($b = -2.43$) of these two variables was negatively related to life satisfaction. In contrast, no significant relationships were found for the American cohort, $F(3,29) = .68$, $p = .5697$, $R^2 = .07$.

Insert Table 5 about here

For ES, the findings were the opposite. The relationship found in the full model remained the same for the American students but not the Thais. Only the ES main effect ($b = .55$) was significant for the American cohort, not WN or the interaction effect, $F(1,31) = 6.29$, $p = .0176$, $R^2 = .17$. In contrast, no significant relationships were found for the Thai cohort, $F(3,20) = 2.14$, $p = .1270$, $R^2 = .24$.

Discussion

These results do not fully support Steiner and Truxillo's (1987) findings that the disaggregation hypothesis relates to intrinsic satisfaction while the spillover model relates to extrinsic satisfaction. For this sample, the results supported the spillover model for both intrinsic and extrinsic satisfaction when the two groups were considered together. In this case, both intrinsic and extrinsic job satisfaction were positively related to life satisfaction, with no mediating effect of work-nonwork values and no interaction effect.

However, when considering the subjects from the two cultures separately, the results differ. The regression results using intrinsic satisfaction for the Thai educators support a disaggregation hypothesis while the segmentalist approach was supported for extrinsic satisfaction. For the intrinsic satisfaction results, all three variables (IS, WN, IS X WN Interaction) were related to life satisfaction; however, for Thai subjects who placed more value on work, the relationship between intrinsic satisfaction and life satisfaction was lower than for those who had lower work value scores. This is the opposite of Steiner and Truxillo's (1987) interaction where for those who had higher work values, there was a stronger relationship between intrinsic satisfaction and life satisfaction than for those with moderate or low work values. For extrinsic satisfaction, none of the variables was significantly related to life satisfaction.

For the American cohort, the segmentalist approach was supported for intrinsic satisfaction because no variables were significantly related to life satisfaction. In contrast, the spillover model was supported for extrinsic satisfaction because this variable was directly related to life satisfaction.

In contrast to these disaggregated results, the aggregated regression results provide a more stable consistent pattern that may be analyzed (although it may mask cultural differences) and compared to others' findings. For American and Thai educators combined, both intrinsic and extrinsic job satisfaction spills over positively to life satisfaction, no matter how important the value of work is to an individual. This support for the spillover theory may be related to the profession examined. Steiner and Truxillo (1987), Iris and Barrett (1972), and Orpen (1978) all suggested that the value of work or job involvement may be a mediating influence between job and life satisfaction. These researchers' results were all based on samples employed in managerial or industrial positions. Yet this study examined educators. Observations from one of the few studies (Sorcinelli & Near, 1989) that used educators (university faculty) to examine the job satisfaction-life satisfaction relationship apply here. For faculty, the relationship among "work, family life, and leisure activities suggests that academic work and life away from work are coterminous. For many faculty the career is both vocation and avocation" (p. 59). Because the distinction between work and nonwork is blurred, it would be logical that the distinction between intrinsic and extrinsic satisfaction would be more difficult to disentangle than for industrial employees, who may easily separate the two worlds. The results of this study for the aggregated sample coincide with the university study: the spillover model is supported. Both one's satisfaction with the intrinsic and extrinsic aspects of the job affect how satisfied one is with life in general. However, unlike the Sorcinelli and Near findings, the correlations between life and job satisfaction were not higher than those reported in the

general published literature. Sorcinelli and Near found $r = .64$ for faculty, while our correlations (.36 to .39) were closer to the average correlation (.31) reported in other studies (1989, p. 69). Because approximately half of this sample were K-12 educators rather than university faculty, the differences in settings may influence them to react more like managers in industry. Future research comparing these two groups could provide more insight.

The factor solutions for this sample also support Sorcinelli and Near's (1989) contention that the distinction between work and nonwork for educators is not clear. The intrinsic and extrinsic factors reported in the literature were not separated clearly using factor analysis. For example, the item, The chance to be "somebody" in the community, belongs to the same factor as the item, The feeling of accomplishment I get from the job, supposedly from two distinct constructs. Further, the extrinsic satisfaction factor differs more from theory for the American than the Thai cohort, indicating the cultural differences alone are not operating. The Thai cohort's factor solution for extrinsic satisfaction more closely resembles Steiner and Truxillo's (1989) while the American cohort's resembles Weiss et al.'s (1967). Intrinsic satisfaction did match theory more closely for both groups, although extrinsic items loaded on the first factor as well.

On the basis of the factor analysis results, there is a clear need for further research in the area of job satisfaction as measured by the MSQ short form although the internal consistency reliabilities of the scales were acceptable. More specifically, the disparity between the factor loadings for intrinsic and extrinsic job satisfaction for the current study and the results reported by Weiss

et al. (1967) in the MSQ manual indicates instability of the two factors in this small sample that warrant further research. In calling for further research, it should be noted that the sample for the present study differed greatly from the samples used in the research undertaken by Weiss et al. The discrepancy between the theoretical constructs and our tentative factor analysis results poses a dilemma. As Locke (1983) pointed out, using factor solutions based on the peculiarities of one data set instead of using variables as defined by theory adds "little to our understanding of basic job dimensions" (p. 1301). Yet, ideally, there should be some congruity between the two. Thus, even though our factor analysis results did not support Steiner and Truxillo's (1987) definition, we chose to use their theoretical constructs in this replication study.

A second outcome of the factor analysis and regression analyses also warrants further investigation. Preliminary results indicate that the American and Thai cohorts may differ in the basic underlying understanding and value of job satisfaction, life satisfaction, and work that may be masked when the data are aggregated. As Hofstede (1990) pointed out in comparing French and American managers using Maslow's categories, "American theories fit American value patterns....If we recognize culture as an all-encompassing influence this should be no surprise" (p. 32). Although Steiner and Truxillo only reported aggregated responses, we believe the two groups' cultures differ enough that analyzing each separately would provide more insight. When Hofstede (1980) compared Americans and Thais (2 of 40 countries in his study), they differed on all four dimensions studied: masculinity, individualism, power distance, and uncertainty avoidance. Because all four dimensions relate to

differences in work values, one needs to investigate further the validity of transferring the theories related to job satisfaction and life satisfaction across these two cultures although both groups are similar in other crucial dimensions.

In summary, further research is needed in light of the differences in the results from the Steiner and Truxillo (1987) study and the current study. There was inconsistency between the items selected on the basis of research (Steiner & Truxillo, 1987) and the loadings of the items on the two scales based on the factor analysis of this sample. Further, The current study needs to be replicated with a larger sample similar to the one used in this study to determine the stability of the results. Additionally, a planned comparison between educators who primarily teach at K-12 and university levels could help refine our understanding how job satisfaction and life satisfaction interact for these two samples. Also, it may be worthwhile to utilize subjects from other regions, again to determine the stability of the current results. Finally, it might be worthwhile to conduct a concurrent validation study to determine the stability of factor loadings from long to short forms of the MSQ.

References

Burke, R. J., Weir, T., & DuWors, R. E., Jr. (1979). Type A behavior of administrators and wives' reports of marital satisfaction and well-being. Journal of Applied Psychology, 64, 57-65.

Hofstede, G. (1980). Culture's consequences: International differences in work-related values. Beverly Hills, CA: Sage.

Iris, B., & Barrett, G. V. (1972). Some relations between job and life satisfaction and job importance. Journal of Applied Psychology, 56, 301-304.

Lofquist, L. H., & Dawis, R. V. (1969). Adjustment to work: A psychological view of man's problems in a work-oriented society. New York: Appleton-Century-Crofts.

Locke, E. A. (1983). The nature and causes of job satisfaction in M. D. Dunnette (Ed.), Handbook of industrial and organizational psychology (pp. 1295-1349). New York: John Wiley & Sons.

Orpen, C. (1978). Work and nonwork satisfaction: A causal-correlational analysis. Journal of Applied Psychology, 63, 530-532.

Sorcinelli, M. D., & Near, J. P. (1989). Relations between work and life away from work among university faculty. Journal of Higher Education, 60, 59-81.

Steiner, D. D., & Truxillo, D. M. (1987). Another look at the job satisfaction-life satisfaction relationship: A test of the disaggregation hypothesis. Journal of Occupational Behaviour, 8, 71-77.

Weiss, D. J., Dawis, R. V., England, G. W., & Lofquist, L. H. (1967). Manual for the Minnesota satisfaction questionnaire. Minneapolis, MN: Vocational Psychology Research.

Table 1

Items Defining Intrinsic and Extrinsic Job Satisfaction

	Intrinsic Items	Extrinsic Items
Weiss MSQ:		
	1 2 3 4 7 8 9	5 6 12
	10 11 15 16 20	13 14 19
Steiner & Truxillo:		
	1 2 3 7 9 10	4 8
	11 12 15 16 20	13 14
	Factor 1	Factor 2
This Study:		
	3 4 5 6 7 11	8 10 12 13
	18 19 20	14 15 16 17

Table 2

Factor Loading for Two-Factor Solution: Both Thai and American Subjects Combined

Factor 1		Factor 2	
Item	Factor Loading	Item	Factor Loading
3*	.49	8*	.60
4	.45	10	.57
5	.80	12	59
6	.74	13*	.46
7*	.46	14*	.41
11*	.58	15	.63
18	.40	16	.69
19	.59	17	.76
20*	.77		

*Items, as defined by Steiner and Truxillo (1987), that loaded on each factor.

Table 3

Factor Loading for Two-Factor Solution: American (n = 34) and Thai Subjects (n = 25) Separately

Factor 1				Factor 2			
	American	Thai		American		Thai	
Item	Load	Item	Load	Item	Load	Item	Load
2*	.61	1*	.64	5	.83	4*	.65
3*	.50	2*	.48	6	.82	5	.83
4	.70	3*	.58	7	.66	6*	.80
8	.64	7*	.52	19	54	15	.63
11*	.76	8	.63			16	65
12*	.68	9*	.85			18	.76
13	.63	10*	.78			19	.54
14	.44	11*	.69				
15*	.76	12*	.57				
16*	.88	17	.84				
18	.62	20*	.69				
20*	.58						

*Items, as defined by Steiner and Truxillo (1987), that loaded on each factor.

Table 4

Descriptive Statistics and Intercorrelation Matrix

Variable	n	M	s	Correlation (n = 56) IS	ES	LS
IS	57	3.99	.58			
ES	58	3.58	.67	.49*		
LS	58	3.55	.94	.36*	.39*	
WN	58	1.97	.65	-.05	.02	.01

*$p < .05$

IS = intrinsic job satisfaction

ES = extrinsic job satisfaction

LS = life satisfaction

WN = work-nonwork values

Table 5

Thai Cohort Multiple Regression Results: Life Satisfaction

Source	SS	df	MS	F	p
Regression	9.07	3	3.02	4.24*	.0187
Residual	13.54	19	.71		

Variable	b	se b	t	p
Intrinsic Job Satis.	5.64	2.33	2.42*	.0257
Work-Nonwork Values	9.95	4.59	2.17*	.0432
IS X WN Interaction	-2.43	1.14	-2.13*	.0466

*$p < .05$.